

Evolution Discussion Group 2016

Pleiotropy Final Reading list

Categorization of a few of the papers:

Reviews/conceptual: He and Zhang 2006, Hodgkin 1998, Paaby and Rockman and responses, Pyeritz 1989, Stearn 2000, Stearns 2010, Wagner and Zhang 2011 and responses

Empirical: Albert et al 2008, Barrett et al 2009, Des Marais and Rausher 2008, Lovell et al 2013 versus Scarcelli et al 2007, Nichols et al 2011, Paaby et al 2014, Streisfeld and Rausher 2011, Wagner et al 2008, Wang 2010

Theory: Barton 1990, Lourenco et al 2011, Slatkin 1982, Otto 2004, Orr 200, Welch and Waxman 2003

Methods: David et al 2013, Gianola et al 2015 (really about markers estimating rG), Lebreton et al. 1998, Schrooten and Bovenhuis 2002

- Albert, A. Y. K., S. Sawaya, T. H. Vines, A. K. Knecht, C. T. Miller, B. R. Summers, S. Balabhadra, D. M. Kingsley, and D. Schluter. 2008. The genetics of adaptive shape shift in stickleback: pleiotropy and effect size. *Evolution* 62:76-85.
- Barrett, R. D. H., S. M. Rogers, and D. Schluter. 2009. Environment specific pleiotropy facilitates divergence at the ectodysplasin locus in threespine stickleback. *Evolution* 63:2831-2837.
- Barton, N. H. 1990. Pleiotropic models of quantitative variation. *Genetics* 124:773-782.
- Bomblies, K., and J. F. Doebley. 2006. Pleiotropic Effects of the Duplicate Maize FLORICAULA/LEAFY Genes *zfl1* and *zfl2* on Traits Under Selection During Maize Domestication. *Genetics* 172:519-531.
- Borowsky, R. 2013. Eye regression in blind *Astyanax* cavefish may facilitate the evolution of an adaptive behavior and its sensory receptors. *BMC biology* 11:81.
- Bost, B., D. de Vienne, F. Hospital, L. Moreau, and C. Dillmann. 2001. Genetic and Nongenetic Bases for the L-Shaped Distribution of Quantitative Trait Loci Effects. *Genetics* 157:1773-1787.
- Brem, R. B., G. Yvert, R. Clinton, and L. Kruglyak. 2002. Genetic dissection of transcriptional regulation in budding yeast. *Science* 296:752-755.
- Carbone, M. A., K. W. Jordan, R. F. Lyman, S. T. Harbison, J. Leips, T. J. Morgan, M. DeLuca, P. Awadalla, and T. F. C. Mackay. 2006. Phenotypic Variation and Natural Selection at *Catsup*, a Pleiotropic Quantitative Trait Gene in *Drosophila*. *Current Biology* 16:912-919.
- Carter, A. J., and A. Q. Nguyen. 2011. Antagonistic pleiotropy as a widespread mechanism for the maintenance of polymorphic disease alleles. *BMC Med Genet* 12:160.
- Cheverud, J. M. 1996. Developmental integration and the evolution of pleiotropy. *Amer. Zool.* 36:44-50.

- David, I., J. M. Elsen, and D. Concordet. 2013. CLIP Test: a new fast, simple and powerful method to distinguish between linked or pleiotropic quantitative trait loci in linkage disequilibrium analysis. *Heredity (Edinb)* 110:232-238.
- Des Marais, D. L., and M. D. Rausher. 2008. Escape from adaptive conflict after duplication in an anthocyanin pathway gene. *Nature* 454:762-765.
- Dudley, A. M., D. M. Janse, A. Tanay, R. Shamir, and G. M. Church. 2005. A global view of pleiotropy and phenotypically derived gene function in yeast. *Molecular Systems Biology* 1:2005.0001-2005.0001.
- Estes, S., and P. C. Phillips. 2006. Variation in pleiotropy and the mutational underpinnings of the G-matrix. *Evolution* 60:2655-2660.
- Featherstone, D. E., and K. Broadie. 2002. Wrestling with pleiotropy: Genomic and topological analysis of the yeast gene expression network. *BioEssays* 24:267-274.
- Gardner, K. M., and R. G. Latta. 2007. Shared quantitative trait loci underlying the genetic correlation between continuous traits. *Molecular Ecology* 16:4195-4209.
- Gianola, D., G. de los Campos, M. A. Toro, H. Naya, C.-C. Schön, and D. Sorensen. 2015. Do Molecular Markers Inform About Pleiotropy? *Genetics* 201:23-29.
- Gommans, W. M., S. P. Mullen, and S. Maas. 2009. RNA editing: a driving force for adaptive evolution? *BioEssays* 31:1137-1145.
- Griswold, C. K., and M. C. Whitlock. 2003. The genetics of adaptation: The roles of pleiotropy, stabilizing selection and drift in shaping the distribution of bidirectional fixed mutational effects. *Genetics* 165:2181-2192.
- Guillaume, F., and S. P. Otto. 2012. Gene functional trade-offs and the evolution of pleiotropy. *Genetics* 192:1389-1409.
- He, X., and J. Zhang. 2006. Toward a Molecular Understanding of Pleiotropy. *Genetics* 173:1885-1891.
- Hill, W. G., and X. S. Zhang. 2012. Assessing pleiotropy and its evolutionary consequences: pleiotropy is not necessarily limited, nor need it hinder the evolution of complexity. *Nat Rev Genet* 13:296; author reply 296.
- Hodgkin, J. 1998. Seven types of pleiotropy. *Int J Dev Biol* 42:501-505.
- Jasmin, J. N., and C. Zeyl. 2013. Evolution of pleiotropic costs in experimental populations. *J. Evol. Biol.* 26:1363-1369.
- Jones, A. G., S. J. Arnold, and R. Burger. 2007. The mutation matrix and the evolution of evolvability. *Evolution* 61:727-745.
- Juenger, T., J. M. Pérez-Pérez, S. Bernal, and J. L. Micol. 2005. Quantitative trait loci mapping of floral and leaf morphology traits in *Arabidopsis thaliana*: evidence for modular genetic architecture. *Evolution & Development* 7:259-271.
- Kenney-Hunt, J. P., B. Wang, E. A. Norgard, G. Fawcett, D. Falk, L. S. Pletscher, J. P. Jarvis, C. Roseman, J. Wolf, and J. M. Cheverud. 2008. Pleiotropic patterns of quantitative trait loci for 70 murine skeletal traits. *Genetics* 178:2275-2288.
- Lande, R. 1980. The genetic covariance between characters maintained by pleiotropic mutations. *Genetics* 94:203-215.
- Lebreton, C. M., P. M. Visscher, C. S. Haley, A. Semikhodskii, and S. A. Quarrie. 1998. A nonparametric bootstrap method for testing close linkage vs. pleiotropy of coincident quantitative trait loci. *Genetics* 150:931-943.

- Li, R., S.-W. Tsaih, K. Shockley, I. M. Stylianou, J. Wergedal, B. Paigen, and G. A. Churchill. 2006. Structural Model Analysis of Multiple Quantitative Traits. *PLoS Genet* 2:e114.
- Lourenco, J., N. Galtier, and S. Glemin. 2011. Complexity, pleiotropy, and the fitness effect of mutations. *Evolution* 65:1559-1571.
- Lovell, J. T., T. E. Juenger, S. D. Michaels, J. R. Lasky, A. Platt, J. H. Richards, X. Yu, H. M. Easlon, S. Sen, and J. K. McKay. 2013. Pleiotropy of FRIGIDA enhances the potential for multivariate adaptation. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 280.
- Mackay, T. F., and R. F. Lyman. 2005. Drosophila bristles and the nature of quantitative genetic variation. *Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci* 360:1513-1527.
- Mank, J. E., L. Hultin-Rosenberg, M. Zwahlen, and H. Ellegren. 2008. Pleiotropic constraint hampers the resolution of sexual antagonism in vertebrate gene expression. *Am Nat* 171:35-43.
- McGee, L. W., E. W. Aitchison, S. B. Caudle, A. J. Morrison, L. Zheng, W. Yang, and D. R. Rokyta. 2014. Payoffs, Not Tradeoffs, in the Adaptation of a Virus to Ostensibly Conflicting Selective Pressures. *PLoS Genet* 10:e1004611.
- McGee, L. W., A. M. Sackman, A. J. Morrison, J. Pierce, J. Anisman, and D. R. Rokyta. 2016. Synergistic Pleiotropy Overrides the Costs of Complexity in Viral Adaptation. *Genetics* 202:285-295.
- McGuigan, K., J. M. Collet, S. L. Allen, S. F. Chenoweth, and M. W. Blows. 2014. Pleiotropic mutations are subject to strong stabilizing selection. *Genetics* 197:1051-1062.
- Mills, M. G., A. K. Greenwood, and C. L. Peichel. 2014. Pleiotropic effects of a single gene on skeletal development and sensory system patterning in sticklebacks. *Evodevo* 5:5.
- Mitri, S., and K. R. Foster. 2016. Pleiotropy and the low cost of individual traits promote cooperation. *Evolution*:n/a-n/a.
- Mode, C. J., and H. F. Robinson. 1959. Pleiotropism and the genetic variance and covariance. *Biometrics* 15:518-537.
- Nichols, R. J., S. Sen, Y. J. Choo, P. Beltrao, M. Zietek, R. Chaba, S. Lee, K. M. Kazmierczak, K. J. Lee, A. Wong, M. Shales, S. Lovett, M. E. Winkler, N. J. Krogan, A. Typas, and C. A. Gross. 2011. Phenotypic landscape of a bacterial cell. *Cell* 144:143-156.
- Oakley, C. G., J. Ågren, R. A. Atchison, and D. W. Schemske. 2014. QTL mapping of freezing tolerance: links to fitness and adaptive trade-offs. *Molecular Ecology* 23:4304-4315.
- Orr, H. A. 2000. Adaptation and the cost of complexity. *Evolution* 54:13-20.
- Ostrowski, E. A., D. E. Rozen, and R. E. Lenski. 2005. Pleiotropic effects of beneficial mutations in *Escherichia coli*. *Evolution* 59:2343-2352.
- Otto, S. P. 2004. Two steps forward, one step back: the pleiotropic effects of favoured alleles. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 271:705-714.
- Paaby, A. B., A. O. Bergland, E. L. Behrman, and P. S. Schmidt. 2014. A highly pleiotropic amino acid polymorphism in the Drosophila insulin receptor contributes to life-history adaptation. *Evolution* 68:3395-3409.

- Paaby, A. B., and M. V. Rockman. 2013. The many faces of pleiotropy. *Trends Genet* 29:66-73.
- Papakostas, S., L. A. Vollestad, M. Bruneaux, T. Aykanat, J. Vanoverbeke, M. Ning, C. R. Primmer, and E. H. Leder. 2014. Gene pleiotropy constrains gene expression changes in fish adapted to different thermal conditions. *Nat Commun* 5:4071.
- Pavlicev, M., J. P. Kenney-Hunt, E. A. Norgard, C. C. Roseman, J. B. Wolf, and J. M. Cheverud. 2008. Genetic variation in pleiotropy: differential epistasis as a source of variation in the allometric relationship between long bone lengths and body weight. *Evolution* 62:199-213.
- Pyeritz, R. E. 1989. Pleiotropy revisited: Molecular explanations of a classic concept. *American Journal of Medical Genetics* 34:124-134.
- Scarcelli, N., J. M. Cheverud, B. A. Schaal, and P. X. Kover. 2007. Antagonistic pleiotropic effects reduce the potential adaptive value of the FRIGIDA locus. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 104:16986-16991.
- Schrooten, C., and H. Bovenhuis. 2002. Detection of pleiotropic effects of quantitative trait loci in outbred populations using regression analysis. *Journal Of Dairy Science* 85:3503-3513.
- Slatkin, M. 1982. Pleiotropy and Parapatric Speciation. *Evolution* 36:263-270.
- Smith, S. D. 2016. Pleiotropy and the evolution of floral integration. *New Phytol.* 209:80-85.
- Sonnichsen, B., L. B. Koski, A. Walsh, P. Marschall, B. Neumann, M. Brehm, A. M. Alleaume, J. Artelt, P. Bettencourt, E. Cassin, M. Hewitson, C. Holz, M. Khan, S. Lazik, C. Martin, B. Nitzsche, M. Ruer, J. Stamford, M. Winzi, R. Heinkel, M. Roder, J. Finell, H. Hantsch, S. J. M. Jones, M. Jones, F. Piano, K. C. Gunsalus, K. Oegema, P. Gonczy, A. Coulson, A. A. Hyman, and C. J. Echeverri. 2005. Full-genome RNAi profiling of early embryogenesis in *Caenorhabditis elegans*. *Nature* 434:462-469.
- Stearns, F. W. 2010. One hundred years of pleiotropy: a retrospective. *Genetics* 186:767-773.
- Stern, D. L. 2000. Perspective: Evolutionary developmental biology and the problem of variation. *Evolution* 54:1079-1091.
- Streisfeld, M. A., and M. D. Rausher. 2011. Population genetics, pleiotropy, and the preferential fixation of mutations during adaptive evolution. *Evolution* 65:629-642.
- Su, Z., Y. Zeng, and X. Gu. 2010. A preliminary analysis of gene pleiotropy estimated from protein sequences. *J Exp Zool B Mol Dev Evol* 314:115-122.
- Tenaillon, O. 2014. The Utility of Fisher's Geometric Model in Evolutionary Genetics. *Annu Rev Ecol Evol Syst* 45:179-201.
- Turelli, M., and N. H. Barton. 2004. Polygenic variation maintained by balancing selection: Pleiotropy, sex-dependent allelic effects and GxE interactions. *Genetics* 166:1053-1079.
- Varona, L., L. Gómez-Raya, W. M. Rauw, A. Clop, C. Ovilo, and J. L. Noguera. 2004. Derivation of a Bayes Factor to Distinguish Between Linked or Pleiotropic Quantitative Trait Loci. *Genetics* 166:1025-1035.

- Wagner, G. P., J. P. Kenney-Hunt, M. Pavlicev, J. R. Peck, D. Waxman, and J. M. Cheverud. 2008. Pleiotropic scaling of gene effects and the 'cost of complexity'. *Nature* 452:470-472.
- Wagner, G. P., and J. Zhang. 2011. The pleiotropic structure of the genotype–phenotype map: the evolvability of complex organisms. *Nat Rev Genet* 12:204-213.
- Wagner, G. P., and J. Zhang. 2012. Universal pleiotropy is not a valid null hypothesis: reply to Hill and Zhang. *Nat Rev Genet* 13:296-296.
- Wang, Z., B.-Y. Liao, and J. Zhang. 2010. Genomic patterns of pleiotropy and the evolution of complexity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107:18034-18039.
- Waxman, D., and J. R. Peck. 1998. Pleiotropy and the preservation of perfection. *Science* 279:1210-1214.
- Welch, J. J., and D. Waxman. 2003. Modularity and the cost of complexity. *Evolution* 57:1723-1734.
- Williams, G. C. 1957. Pleiotropy, Natural Selection, and the Evolution of Senescence. *Evolution* 11:398-411.
- Yoshizawa, M., Y. Yamamoto, K. E. O'Quin, and W. R. Jeffery. 2012. Evolution of an adaptive behavior and its sensory receptors promotes eye regression in blind cavefish. *BMC biology* 10:108.
- Zhang, X.-S., and W. G. Hill. 2003. Multivariate stabilizing selection and pleiotropy in the maintenance of quantitative genetic variation. *Evolution* 57:1761-1775.